

To: Martyn Smith[martynts@berkeley.edu]; Cogliano, Vincent[cogliano.vincent@epa.gov]; 'Chris Portier'[cportier@me.com]; bucher@niehs.nih.gov[bucher@niehs.nih.gov]; Gibbons, Catherine[Gibbons.Catherine@epa.gov]; 'Kate Guyton'[GuytonK@iarc.fr]; Fritz, Jason[Fritz.Jason@epa.gov]; DeMarini, David[DeMarini.David@epa.gov]; iir@unc.edu[iir@unc.edu]; lambert@oncology.wisc.edu[lambert@oncology.wisc.edu]; Kavlock, Robert[Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov]; hecht002@umn.edu[hecht002@umn.edu]; 'Robert Baan'[BaanR@iarc.fr]; 'Kurt Straif'[straifk@iarc.fr]
From: Caldwell, Jane
Sent: Tue 1/20/2015 3:31:53 PM
Subject: RE: Characteristics of carcinogens paper - next draft

Dear Martyn,

I will review this draft of the paper but I have a few issues to raise first.

The timeline for returning comments to you is not consistent with the process we have at EPA for clearance. The EPA authors must get any paper of this type through clearance which will involve internal review. I will also need time to adequately read the paper and you will need time to incorporate comments from me and other authors.

The authorship of the paper I think needs discussion. As I see this, it is a hybrid effort that stems from the work done at the IARC tumor concordance workshops, advice given by myself and David DeMarini to refine and further develop a scheme to categorize mechanistic data so that it can be collected and analyzed to IARC, and work to further develop such a scheme under the auspices of the NCEA toxpathways workgroup for use in assessments and applied to the Chromium assessment. This effort has a number of IARC authors on it, but a number of authors that actively contributed in the initial discussions over two meetings - e.g., Agnes Kane, Ron Melnick, James Bond, and Bernard Stewart - are not listed as authors. I think the IARC effort should be properly credited here and that authorship deserves more discussion.

I think it is very important to get this work published and that it is an important product that has resulted from the initial IARC effort. I think this is an important product to help NCEA in its effort to collect appropriate mechanistic data for cancer so that it can be analyzed. We had many discussions at IARC and within the toxpathways workgroup regarding that nature of what these categories are and are not - they are not mechanisms of action of cancer in themselves.

I do not think the current request for review and to send the paper out by next week is a realistic timeline.

I will send you specific comments on the document soon.

Jane Caldwell

-----Original Message-----

From: Martyn Smith [mailto:martynts@berkeley.edu]
Sent: Sunday, January 18, 2015 7:42 AM
To: Martyn Smith; Cogliano, Vincent; 'Chris Portier'; Caldwell, Jane; bucher@niehs.nih.gov; Gibbons, Catherine; 'Kate Guyton'; Fritz, Jason; DeMarini, David; iir@unc.edu; lambert@oncology.wisc.edu; Kavlock, Robert; hecht002@umn.edu; 'Robert Baan'; 'Kurt Straif'
Subject: Characteristics of carcinogens paper - next draft

Dear all

I attach the latest draft of the paper following considerable editing mostly by Kathryn, Vince, Jason, Catherine, Chris and I. Ivan, Robert, Stephen, John and Bob have also put in significant edits and expressed some reservations which we have tried to address.

There are still two mechanistic examples to add and I regret I am traveling so couldn't fully update the

references which are highlighted in yellow.

The manuscript is 5,100 words in length and may be most appropriate as a Commentary for Environmental Health Perspectives with Carcinogenesis as a possible journal back-up. Your thoughts on publication?

I look forward to additional comments and edits from you. I would like to submit the paper in the week of Jan 26th and so would ask for edits by Monday Jan 26.

Thanks

Martyn

Martyn T. Smith, Ph.D.

Professor & Director, Superfund Research Program Division of Environmental Health Sciences School of Public Health Li Ka Shing Center, Rm 386 University of California Berkeley, California 94720-7356

(510) 642-8770 tel / (510) 642-0427 fax

(510) 334-1222 (cell)

(510) 643-5100 (assistant)

email: martynts@berkeley.edu

This message and its attachments are strictly confidential. If you are not the intended recipient of this message, please immediately notify the sender and delete it. Since its integrity cannot be guaranteed, its content cannot involve the sender's responsibility. Any misuse, any disclosure or publication of its content, either whole or partial, is prohibited, exception made of formally approved use.
